

## **Ruins & Reconstruction**

Instructor: Lynn Meskell

### **Location**

### **Meeting Time**

**Seminar:** 3hr, max enrolment 20

This class examines our enduring fascination with ruins coupled with our commitments to reconstruction from theoretical, ethical, socio-political and practical perspectives. This includes analyzing international conventions and principles, to the work of heritage agencies and NGOs, to the implications for specific local communities and development trajectories. We will explore global case studies featuring archaeological and monumental sites with an attention to context and communities, as well as the construction of expertise and implications of international intervention. Issues of conservation from the material to the digital will also be examined. Throughout the course we will be asking what a future in ruins holds for a variety of fields and disciplines, as well as those who have most to win or lose in the preservation of the past.

### **Requirements**

**Assessment 1:** Class presentation and oral participation (40%). This is a seminar, *not a lecture-course*, and consistent participation by all members is vital. Each of you will select specific readings the discussion of which you will commit to facilitate. Facilitation entails coming up with questions that will enable constructive and well-informed conversation based on presentations of the readings. It is expected that all students will attend all classes and participate in all discussions.

**Assessment 2:** Research paper to be handed in at the end of term on a topic developed in consultation with the instructor (60%). The paper should: (a) show that you have read and understood the texts at hand; and (b) provide an opportunity for you to think about the material in relation to your own writing and research. For undergraduates, the paper is to be double-spaced and approximately 15-20 pages in length. Papers submitted by graduate students are expected to be more detailed at 20-25 pages or longer, to be discussed with the instructor. **The paper is due on the last class of the semester.** Please email me an electronic copy of your essay. Late papers will not be accepted.

**Schedule of Meetings** The following lecture outlines and readings may be slightly modified in the course of the seminar.

### **Background Reading:**

Meskell, Lynn. 2018. *A Future in Ruins: UNESCO, World Heritage and the Dream of Peace*. New York: Oxford University Press.

**WEEK 1 Jan 12** Introduction to course, assessment and seminar designations

**WEEK 2 Jan 19 The Cult of Monuments**

\*Allais, Lucia. 2018. *Designs of Destruction: The Making of Monuments in the Twentieth Century*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press. **Introduction**

\*Choay, Françoise. 2001. *The Invention of the Historic Monument*. New York: Cambridge University Press. **Introduction, Chapter 1, and Chapter 4**

\*Huysen, A. 1993. "Monument and memory in a postmodern age." *Yale Journal of Criticism* 6(2), 249-261.

\*Lamprakos, Michele. 2014. "Riegl's Modern Cult of Monuments and The Problem of Value." *Change Over Time* 4 (2):418-435.

\*Musil, Robert. 1987. *Posthumous Papers of a Living Author. Posthumous Papers of a Living Author Volume 1*. Eridanos Press: 61-64. **Monuments**

\*Riegl, Alois. 1903 "The Modern Cult of Monuments: Its Character and Its Origin," in *Oppositions*, n. 25 (Fall 1982): 21-51.

**WEEK 3 Jan 26 Theorizing Ruins**

\*DeSilvey, C., and T. Edensor. 2013. "Reckoning with Ruins." *Progress in Human Geography* 37 (4):465-485.

\*Featherstone, Mark. 2005. "Ruin Value." *Journal for Cultural Research* 9 (3):301-320.

\*Hell, Julia, and Andreas Schonle. 2010. *Ruins of Modernity*. Durham: Duke University Press. **Introduction**

\*Lopez Galviz, Carlos, Nadia Bartolini, Mark Pendleton, and Adam Stock. 2017. "Reconfiguring Ruins: Beyond Ruinenlust." *GeoHumanities* 3 (2):531-553.

\*Murray, Simon David. 2020. *Performing Ruins*. **Chapters 1 and Chapter 2**

\*Stewart, Susan. 2020. *The Ruins Lesson: Meaning and Material in Western Culture*. **Introduction**

\*Stoler, Ann. 2008. "Imperial Debris." *Cultural Anthropology* 23 (2):191-219.

**WEEK 4 Feb 2 Classical Ruinscapes**

\*Devecka, Martin. 2020. *Broken Cities: A Historical Sociology of Ruins*. **Chapters 1 and Chapter 2**

\* Hell, Julia, 2019 *The Conquest of Ruins*. Chicago: Chicago University Press. **Introduction, Chapter 1 and Chapter 2**

\*Huysen, Andreas. 2006. "Nostalgia for Ruins." *Grey Room*: 6-21.

\*Murray, Simon David. 2020. *Performing Ruins*. **Chapter 3**

\*Stewart, Susan. 2020. *The Ruins Lesson: Meaning and Material in Western Culture*. **Chapter 1**

\*Porter, James I. 2011. "Sublime monuments and sublime ruins in ancient aesthetics." *European Review of History: Revue Européenne d'Histoire* 18 (5-6):685-696.

**WEEK 5 Feb 9 Archaeological Ruins**

\*Beasley-Murray, Jon. 2010. "Vilcashuamán: Telling Stories in Ruins'." In *Ruins of Modernity*, edited by J. Hell and A. Schonle. Durham: Duke University Press.

\*Byrne, Denis. 2019. *Counterheritage: Critical Perspectives on Heritage Conservation in Asia*. **Introduction and Chapter 5**

\*Gordillo, Gaston. 2009. "The Ruins of Ruins: On the Preservation and Destruction of Historical Sites in Northern Argentina." In *Ethnographies and Archaeologies: Iterations of the Past*, edited by L. Mortensen and J. Hollowell. Gainesville: University Press of Florida: 30–54.

\*Joyce, Rosemary A. 2021. *The Future of Nuclear Waste: What Art and Archaeology Can Tell Us About Securing the World's Most Hazardous Material*. New York: Oxford University Press. **Introduction**

\*Meskell, Lynn. 2002 "Negative Heritage and Past Mastering in Archaeology." *Anthropological Quarterly* 75.3: 557-574.

\*Meskell, Lynn. 2018. *A Future in Ruins: UNESCO, World Heritage and the Dream of Peace*. New York: Oxford University Press. **Chapter 2**

\*Verdesio, Gustavo. 2010. "Invisible at a Glance: Indigenous Cultures of the Past, Ruins, Archaeological Sites, and Our Regimes of Visibility." In *Ruins of Modernity*, edited by J. Hell and A. Schonle. Durham: Duke University Press.

### Online resource

\*Ruin Memories project: <http://ruinmemories.org/about/project-description/>

### WEEK 6 Feb 16 Modern Ruination

\*Goonewardena, Kanishka. 2019. "Monument." In *Keywords in Radical Geography: Antipode at 50: 186-191*.

\*Huysen, Andreas 2010. "Authentic Ruins: Products of Modernity." In *Ruins of Modernity*, edited by J. Hell and A. Schönle. Durham: Duke University Press.

\*González-Ruibal, Alfredo. 2005. "The Need for a Decaying Past: An archaeology of Oblivion in Contemporary Galicia (NW Spain)." *Home Cultures* 2 (2):129-152.

\*Hudson, Joanne 2019. "The Affordances and Potentialities of Derelict Urban Spaces." In *Ruin Memories: Materialities, Aesthetics and the Archaeology of the Recent Past*, edited by Þ. Pétursdóttir and B. Olsen. London: Routledge Taylor & Francis Group.

\*Mah, Alice 2018. "Ruination and Post-industrial Urban Decline". In *The Sage Handbook of the 21st century City*, edited by S., Suzanne, and R. Burdett. Los Angeles: Sage.

\*Pétursdóttir, Þóra. 2013. "Concrete Matters: Ruins of Modernity and the Things Called Heritage." *Journal of Social Archaeology* 13 (1):31-53.

\*Steinmetz, G. 2010. "Colonial Melancholy and Fordist Nostalgia: The Ruinscapes of Namibia and Detroit". In *Ruins of Modernity* edited by J. Hell and A. Schonle. Durham: Duke University Press.

\*Vergara, Camilo José, and Timothy J. Gilfoyle. 2013. *Harlem: The Unmaking of a Ghetto*. Chicago; London: The University of Chicago Press. **Globalization Takes Over: From Sugar Club to Global Church Ruins and Semi-Ruins.**

### Online Resource

\*Equal Justice Initiative: <https://eji.org/reports/>

### WEEK 7 Feb 23 Ruin Porn

\*Clutter, McLain. "Notes on Ruin Porn." *The Avery Review* 18 (2016):1-9.

\*Day, Iyko. "Ruin Porn and the Colonial Imaginary." *PMLA* 136.1 (2021): 125-131.

\*Dillon, Brian. 2012. "Ruin Lust: Our Love Affair with Decaying Buildings." *The Guardian*. <https://www.theguardian.com/artanddesign/2012/feb/17/ruins-love-affair-decayed-buildings>.

\*Wells, Kate 2018. "Detroit was Always Made of Wheels: Confronting Ruin Porn in Its Hometown. In *Ruin Porn and the Obsession with Decay* edited by Siobhan Lyons. Cham, Switzerland: Palgrave Macmillan: 13-30.

\*Nash J., Gibbs M. (2018) "Diachronic Fetishisation: Ruin Porn and Pitcairn Island Language, Archaeology, and Architecture." In *Ruin Porn and the Obsession with Decay* edited by Siobhan Lyons. Cham, Switzerland: Palgrave Macmillan: 137-154.

\*Þóra Pétursdóttir and Bjørnar Olsen. 2019. "An Archaeology of Ruins." In *Ruin Memories: Materialities, Aesthetics and the Archaeology of the Recent Past* edited by Þ. Pétursdóttir and B. Olsen. London: Routledge.

\* Whitehouse, Tanya. 2018. *How Ruins Acquire Aesthetic Value: Modern Ruins, Ruin Porn, and the Ruin Tradition*. Basingstoke, Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan. **Chapter 1** and **Chapter 2**

### Online resources

\*<https://paulmullins.wordpress.com/2012/08/19/the-politics-and-archaeology-of-ruin-porn/>

\*<https://www.theguardian.com/housing-network/2016/feb/15/ruin-porn-detroit-photography-city-homes>

\*<https://archinect.com/news/tag/76809/ruin-porn>

\*<https://www.newstatesman.com/culture/art-design/2016/08/ruin-porn-art-world-s-awkward-obsession-abandoned-soviet-architecture>

### WEEK 8 March 2 Theories of Conservation

\*Allais, Lucia. 2018. *Designs of Destruction: The Making of Monuments in the Twentieth Century*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press. **Chapter 1**.

\*Ashworth, G. J. 1997. "Conservation as Preservation or as Heritage: Two Paradigms and Two Answers." *Built Environment* 23(2): 92-102.

\*Avrami, Erica, Cherie-Nicole Leo, and Alberto Sanchez-Sanchez. 2018 "Confronting Exclusion: Redefining the Intended Outcomes of Historic Preservation." *Change Over Time* 8, no. 1: 102-120.

\*DeSilvey, Caitlin. 2017. *Curated Decay: Heritage Beyond Saving*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press. **Chapter 1** and **4**

\*Garbutt, Eva 2016. "The Care of Living Object: Conserving Rauru and Te Wharepuni a Maui in Germany." In *Decolonizing Conservation: Caring for Maori Meeting Houses Outside* edited by D. Sully. New Zealand. London: Routledge.

\* Matero, Frank. 2013. On Time and the Modalities of Conservation. In *Ethics & Critical Thinking in Conservation* edited by Pamela Hatchfield. American Institute for Conservation of Historic & Artistic Works.

\*Stanley-Price, Nicholas. 2009. "The Reconstruction of Ruins: Principles and Practice." In A. Richmond and A. Bracker (eds.), *Conservation: Principles, Dilemmas and Uncomfortable Truths*. London: Elsevier/Butterworth Heinemann.

### Online resources

\*ICOMOS. 1964. *International Charter for The Conservation and Restoration Of Monuments And Sites (The Venice Charter 1964)*. [https://www.icomos.org/charters/venice\\_e.pdf](https://www.icomos.org/charters/venice_e.pdf)

## WEEK 9 March 16 Destruction and Reconstruction

- \*Adams, David, and Peter J. Larkham. 2019. *The Everyday Experiences of Reconstruction and Regeneration: From Vision to Reality in Birmingham and Coventry*. Abingdon: Oxon. **Chapters 1.**
- \*Allais, Lucia. 2018. *Designs of Destruction: The Making of Monuments in the Twentieth Century*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press. **Chapter 2 and 3**
- \*Gordillo, G. 2015. "Nazi Architecture as Affective Weapon" In *The Funambulist Papers*, edited by Léopold Lambert. Vol 2: 54-63
- \*Hell, Julia, 2019 *The Conquest of Ruins*. Chicago: Chicago University Press. **Part Five. With the End in Mind: The Nazi Empire's Neo-Roman Mimesis and the Ruined Stage of Rome. pp 307-337**
- \*Gordillo, G. 2014. *Rubble: The Afterlife of Destruction*. Durham: Duke University Press. **Conclusions**
- \*Le Blanc A. 2020. "The Conservation of Traumatic Ruins: A Piece of Memorabilia to Perform Urban Resilience." In *Places of Memory and Legacies in an Age of Insecurities and Globalization*, edited by G. O'Reilly. EUROGEO Book Series.

### Online Resources

- \*Coventry: A collage of the past and the present <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=QXBc5LhOwb8>

## WEEK 10 March 23 Authenticity- Post Authenticity

- \*Rico, Trinidad. 2018. "Reclaiming Post-disaster Narratives of Loss in Indonesia." *International Journal of Heritage Studies* 26.1: 8-18.
- \*Luigi Petti, Claudia Trillo, Martina Di Mauro. 2018. Heritage and Reconstruction: Different Perspectives. In *Heritage and Reconstruction: Different Perspectives* edited by U.E. Dorka. Cham: Springer: 101-116.
- \*Lowenthal, David. 1999. "Authenticity: Rock of Faith or Quicksand Quagmire?" *Conservation: Getty Conservation Institute Newsletter* 14 no. 3: 5-8
- \*Labadi, Sophia. 2010. "World Heritage, Authenticity and Post-authenticity: International and National perspectives." In *Heritage and Globalisation*, edited by S. Labadi, and C. Long. Abingdon: Routledge: 66-84.
- \*Lennon, Jane. 2014. "The Venice Charter Down Under: Its Legacy in Landscape Preservation." *Change Over Time*, 4/2: 322-336.
- \*Song, Jiewon. 2020. *Global Tokyo: Heritage, Urban Redevelopment and the Transformation of Authenticity*. Singapore: Springer: 103-128. **Chapter 4**
- \* Orbaşlı, Aylin. 2015. "Nara+20: a theory and practice perspective" *Heritage& Society* 8:2, 178-188
- \*Glendinning, Miles. 2013. *The conservation movement: a history of architectural preservation; from antiquity to modernity*. London, Routledge. **Chapter 11 and Chapter 12**

### Online Resources

- \*ICOMOS. 1994. The Nara Document on Authenticity <https://www.icomos.org/charters/nara-e.pdf>
- \*ICOMOS Australia. The Australia ICOMOS Charter for Places of Cultural Significance. <https://australia.icomos.org/wp-content/uploads/The-Burra-Charter-2013-Adopted-31.10.2013.pdf>
- \*NARA + 20: ON HERITAGE PRACTICES, CULTURAL VALUES, AND THE CONCEPT OF AUTHENTICITY [http://www.japan-icomos.org/pdf/nara20\\_final\\_eng.pdf](http://www.japan-icomos.org/pdf/nara20_final_eng.pdf)
- \*BURRA CHARTER & PRACTICE NOTES: <https://australia.icomos.org/publications/burra-charter-practice-notes/>

### WEEK 11 April 6 War, Destruction and Reconstruction I

- \*Ammar Azzouz (2020) "Re-imagining Syria, Destructive Reconstruction and the Exclusive Rebuilding of Cities". *City*, 24(5-6): 721-740.
- \*Baird, JA. 2020. "The Ruination of Dura-Europos." *Theoretical Roman Archaeology Journal*, 3(1), 2: 1-20.
- \*De Cesari, C. 2015. "Post-Colonial Ruins: Archaeologies of Political Violence and Its." *Anthropology Today* 31 (6):22-26.
- \*Harmanşah, Ö. 2015. "Isis, Heritage, and the Spectacles of Destruction in the Global Media." *Near Eastern Archaeology*, 78 (3):170-177.
- \*Isakhan, B, and L Meskell. 2019. "UNESCO's Project to 'Revive the Spirit of Mosul': Iraqi and Syrian Opinion on Heritage Reconstruction after the Islamic State." *International Journal of Heritage Studies*, 25 (11):1189-1204.
- \*Munawar, N. A. (2017). "Reconstructing Cultural Heritage in Conflict Zones: Should Palmyra be Rebuilt?" *Ex Novo: Journal of Archaeology*, 2: 33-48.
- \*Neglia, Giulia Annalinda. 2020. *Cultural Meaning Of Aleppo : a Landscape Recovery for the Ancient City*. Univ of Chicago Press, 2020. **Introduction, Chapter 1 and Chapter 3.**

### Online Resources

- \*Unite4Heritage <https://www.unite4heritage.org/en/unite4heritage-celebrating-safeguarding-cultural-heritage>
- \*UNESCO 2018. Warsaw Recommendation on the Recovery and Reconstruction of Cultural Heritage Warsaw, 8 May 2018. <https://whc.unesco.org/en/news/1826>
- \*UNESCO 2015 The Bonn Declaration on World Heritage <https://whc.unesco.org/document/147735>

### WEEK 12 April 13 War, Destruction and Reconstruction II

- \*Aposos, Michelle. 2017. "Timbuktu in Terror: Architecture and Iconoclasm in Contemporary Africa". *International Journal of Islamic Architecture*. 6 (1): 97-120.
- \*Bou Akar, Hiba. 2012. "Contesting Beirut's Frontiers." *City & Society*, 24: 150-172.
- \*Bsheer, Rosie. 2020. *Archive Wars: The Politics of History in Saudi Arabia*. Stanford, California: Stanford University Press, **Chapter 4**
- \*Flood, Barry, 2002 "Between Cult and Culture: Bamiyan, Islamic Iconoclasm, and the Museum." *The Art Bulletin*, 84, 4: 641-659.
- \*Janowski, J. 2020. "Bamiyan's Echo: Sounding out the Emptiness." In *Philosophical perspectives on Ruins, Monuments, and Memorials*, edited by J. Bicknell, J. Judkins, & C. Korsmeyer. New York, NY: Routledge, 2020.
- \*Khalidi, Lamyā. "The Destruction of Yemen and its Cultural Heritage." *International Journal of Middle East Studies*, 49.4 (2017): 735-738.
- \*Meskell, Lynn, and Benjamin Isakhan. 2020 "UNESCO, World Heritage and the Gridlock over Yemen." *Third World Quarterly*, 41.10: 1776-1791.

\*Falser, Michael. 2019. *Angkor Wat - A Transcultural History of Heritage. Volume 2: Angkor in Cambodia. From Jungle Find to Global Icon*. Berlin: De Gruyter. **Chapter XI. Making Angkor Global (1970—1990): Hot and Cold War Politics, Competing Inheritance Claims and the Invention of Angkor as Heritage of Humanity**

### Online Resources

Nagaoka, Masanori 2020. The Future of the Bamiyan Buddha Statues.  
<https://www.springer.com/gp/book/9783030513153>

### WEEK 13 April 27 Ethics of Digital Reconstruction

\*Allais, Lucia. 2018. *Designs of Destruction: The Making of Monuments in the Twentieth Century*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press. **Coda Viscosities**

\*Harrer, Alexandra. 2017. "The Legacy of Alois Riegl: Material Authenticity of the Monument in the Digital Age." *Built Heritage* 1 (2):29-40.

\*Khunti, Roshni. 2018. "The Problem with Printing Palmyra: Exploring the Ethics of Using 3D Printing Technology to Reconstruct Heritage." *Studies in Digital Heritage*, 2, 1: 1-12

\*Stobiecka, Monica. (2020). "Archaeological Heritage in the Age of Digital Colonialism." with responses by Lynn Meskell. ("Hijacking ISIS. Digital imperialism and salvage politics.") and Trinidad Rico ("The Second Coming of Palmyra. A Technological Prison.") *Archaeological Dialogues*, 27(2): 113-134.

\*Bülow, William and Joshua Lewis Thomas (2020). "On the Ethics of Reconstructing Destroyed Cultural Heritage Monuments." *Journal of the American Philosophical Association*, 6(4) pp. 483–501

\*Thompson, E. L. 2017. "Legal and Ethical Considerations for Digital Recreations of Cultural Heritage." *Chapman Law Review* 20 (1): 153-76.

### Online Resources

\*California Preservation Foundation: Documenting Sites of Justice in 3D. Speakers: Avidan Fernandez, Kacey Hadick, and Whitney Peterson (CyArk). June 29, 2020.

### Further Online Resources

\***The Romance of Ruins**, Soane Museum London ( May-Sep 2021) <https://www.soane.org/whats-on/romance-ruins>

\***University of Missouri Online exhibition** <https://maa.missouri.edu/sites/default/files/exhibit/online-romance-of-ruins-complete-reduced.pdf>

\*WJT Mitchell "**What Do Monuments Want?**" and Michael Taussig "**Monuments Must Do Better**" from "Monuments, Monumentality, Monumentalization" : <https://youtu.be/caGhHQT9WYY>

\*Monument Lab: <https://monumentlab.com/>

\*Center for the Preservation of Civil Right Sites <https://www.design.upenn.edu/cpcrs/about>

\***Southern Poverty Law Center** "[Whose Heritage? Public Symbols of the Confederacy.](#)"

\*<https://savingplaces.org/african-american-cultural-heritage#.YHyIDS1h2fU>

\*Odevale, Alicia, Karla Slocum, Moriah James, and Nkem Ike. [#TulsaSyllabus: The Rise, Destruction, and Rebuilding of Tulsa's Greenwood District](#). June 2020.