

World Heritage in Global Conflict

Instructor: Lynn Meskell

Heritage is always political. Such a statement might refer to the everyday politics of local stakeholder interests on one end of the spectrum, or the volatile politics of destruction and erasure of heritage during conflict, on the other. If heritage is always political then one might expect that the workings of World Heritage might be especially fraught given the international dimension. In particular, the intergovernmental system of UNESCO World Heritage must navigate the inherent tension between state sovereignty and nationalist interests and the wider concerns of a universal regime. The World Heritage List has almost 1200 properties has many such contentious examples, including sites in Iraq, Mali, Syria, Crimea, Palestine, Armenia and Cambodia. As an organization UNESCO was born of war with an explicit mission to end global conflict and help the world rebuild materially and morally yet has found its own history increasingly entwined with that of international politics and violence.

Requirements

Assessment 1: Class presentation and oral participation (40%). This is a seminar, *not a lecture-course*, and consistent participation by all members is vital. Each of you will select specific readings the discussion of which you will commit to facilitate. Facilitation entails coming up with questions that will enable constructive and well-informed conversation based on presentations of the readings. It is expected that all students will attend all classes and participate in all discussions.

Assessment 2: Research paper to be handed in at the end of term on a topic developed in consultation with the instructor (60%). The paper should: (a) show that you have read and understood the texts at hand; and (b) provide an opportunity for you to think about the material in relation to your own writing and research. For undergraduates, the paper is to be double-spaced and approximately 15-20 pages in length. Papers submitted by graduate students are expected to be more detailed at 20-25 pages or longer, to be discussed with the instructor. **The paper is due on the last class of the term.** Please email me an electronic copy of your essay. Late papers will not be accepted.

Schedule of Meetings

The following lecture outlines and readings may be slightly modified in the course of the seminar.

Class Text: L. Meskell, 2018. *A Future in Ruins: UNESCO, World Heritage and the Dream of Peace*. OUP, New York.

WEEK 1 Introduction to course, assessment and seminar designations (Sept 1)

WEEK 2 Introduction to UNESCO World Heritage (Sept 8)

* Meskell, L. 2018. *A Future in Ruins: UNESCO, World Heritage and the Dream of Peace*. OUP, New York. Chapter 1.

* Meskell, L. 2019. The Politics of Peril: UNESCO's World Heritage List in Danger (with N. Brown and C. Liuzza) *Journal of Field Archaeology* 44/5: 287–303.

- * livestream videos from UNESCO World Heritage Committee Meetings
<http://whc.unesco.org/en/sessions/44COM/records/> and
https://www.youtube.com/results?search_query=world+heritage+committee
- * The Temple That Sparked an Armed Conflict: System Error VICE NEWS
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NwGP3Q9PDGY>

WEEK 3 World Heritage and War (Sept 15)

- * Brosché, J., Legnér, M., Kreutz, J. & Ijla, A., 2017. Heritage under attack: Motives for targeting cultural property during armed conflict. *International Journal of Heritage Studies*, 23 (3), 248-260.
- * Frowe, H and D. Matravers, 2019. *Conflict and Cultural Heritage A Moral Analysis of the Challenges of Heritage Protection*, Getty Occasional Papers 3.
- * Gerstenblith, P. 2014. "Beyond the 1954 Hague Convention," in *Cultural Awareness in the Military: Developments and Implications for Future Humanitarian Cooperation*. Edited by R. Albro and B. Ivey, pp. 83-98. Palgrave Macmillan: New York, *Policy* 20:245-260
- * Meskell, L, 2015. Gridlock: UNESCO, Global Conflict and Failed Ambitions. *World Archaeology*.
- * Meskell, L. 2018. A Future in Ruins: UNESCO, World Heritage and the Dream of Peace. OUP, New York. Chapter 6.
- * Van Der Auwera, S., 2013. UNESCO and the protection of cultural property during armed conflict. *International Journal of Cultural Policy*, 19 (1), 1-19.
- * Vrdoljak, A.F., 2017. Cultural heritage, human rights and the privatisation of war. In Durbach, A. & Lixinski, L. eds. *Heritage, Culture and Rights: Challenging Legal Discourses*. Oxford: Hart Publishing, 61-89.
- * Weiss, T.G & N. Connelly, 2019. Protecting cultural heritage in war zones, *Third World Quarterly*, 40:1, 1-17.

WEEK 4 Angkor Wat, Cambodia (Sept 22)

- * Falser, M, 2015. "Representing Heritage without Territory: The Khmer Rouge at the Unesco in Paris During the 1980s and Their Political Strategy for Angkor," in *Cultural Heritage as Civilizing Mission*. Edited by M. Falser, pp. 225-249. Springer: New York.
- * Falser, M. 2015. "Epilogue: Clearing the Path Towards Civilization: 150 Years of 'Saving Angkor'," in *Cultural Heritage as Civilizing Mission*. Edited by M. Falser, pp. 279-346. Springer: New York,
- * Mura, K. 2015. "Discourses and Practices between Traditions and World Heritage Making in Angkor after 1990," in *Cultural Heritage as Civilizing Mission: From Decay to Recovery*. Edited by M. Falser, pp. 251-278. Springer: New York.
- * Mura, K. 2011. "World Heritage Making in Angkor. Global, Regional, National and Local Actors, Interplays and Implications, in Hauser-Schäublin, Brigitta (Ed) " in *World Heritage Angkor and Beyond: Circumstances and Implications of UNESCO Listings in Cambodia*. Edited by B. Hauser-Schäublin, pp. 9-33. Universitätsverlag Göttingen: Göttingen.

WEEK 5 Preah Vihear, Cambodia (Sept 29)

- * Chachavalpongpun, P. 2012. Embedding Embittered History: Unending Conflicts in Thai-Cambodian Relations. *Asian Affairs* 43:81-102

- * Croissant, A., and P. W. Chambers. 2010. "A Contested Site of Memory: The Preah Vihear Temple," in *Cultures and Globalization: Heritage, Memory & Identity*. Edited by H. K. Anheier and Y. R. Isar, pp. 148-157. SAGE Publications Ltd: London.
- * Hauser-Schäublin, B. 2011. "Preah Vihear. From Object of Colonial Desire to a Contested World Heritage Site," in *World Heritage Angkor and Beyond: Circumstances and Implications of UNESCO Listings in Cambodia*, vol. 2. Edited by B. Hauser-Schäublin, pp. 33-56. Göttingen Studies in Cultural Property: Göttingen,
- * Hauser-Schäublin, B., and S. Missling. 2014. The Enduring Agency of Borderland Regimes: The Aftermath of Serial Regulations with Different Scopes and Temporal Scales at Preah Vihear, Cambodia. *The Journal of Legal Pluralism and Unofficial Law* 46:79-98.
- * Meskell, L. 2016. World Heritage and Wikileaks: Territory, Trade and Temples on the Thai-Cambodian Border. *Current Anthropology* 57 (1), 72-95.

WEEK 6 Bamiyan Valley, Afghanistan (Oct 6)

- * Colwell-Chanthaphonh, C. 2003. Dismembering/Disremembering the Buddhas: Renderings on the Internet During the Afghan Purge of the Past. *Journal of Social Archaeology* 3:75-98.
- * Francioni, F. & Lenzerini, F., 2003. The destruction of the buddhas of Bamiyan and international law. *European Journal of International Law*, 14 (4), 619-651.
- * Meskell, L. 2002. Negative Heritage and Past Mastering in Archaeology. *Anthropological Quarterly* 75:557-574.
- * Gamboni, D. 2001. World Heritage: Shield or Target? *The Getty Conservation Institute*
- * Reza Husseini, S. 2012. Destruction of Bamiyan Buddhas Taliban Iconoclasm and Hazara Response. *Himalayan and Central Asian Studies*, 16(2), 15-0

World-famous Buddhas of Bamiyan resurrected in Afghanistan

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=JI4ozg4iEEw>

Afghanistan Taliban Muslims destroying Bamiyan Buddha Statues

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=xYYBlPWYb7Y>

NATO in Afghanistan - The future of the Bamiyan Buddhas

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=aElJmNYkmG8>

Bamiyan – Crumbling of the Buddhas

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KF9PQ_4iKWA

Rebuilding Bamiyan - Al Jazeera English

Part 1 <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=t9Cu5iOjHQo>

Part 2 <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=JMKtmlFzzCE>

WEEK 7 Palestine (Oct 13)

- * De Cesari, C, 2010. World Heritage and Mosaic Universalism. *Journal of Social Archaeology* 10:299-324.
- * De Cesari, C. 2019. *Heritage and the Cultural Struggle for Palestine*. Stanford University Press, Stanford.
- * Dumper, M., and C. Larkin. 2012. The Politics of Heritage and the Limitations of International Agency in Contested Cities: A Study of the Role of UNESCO in Jerusalem's Old City. *Review of International Studies* 38:25-52.

- * Geller, A. 2013 Culture at the Crossroad of International Politics *UNESCO, World Heritage, and the Holy Land*, Working Paper, <http://www.fondation-pierredubois.ch/Papiers-d-actualite/jerusalem.html>
- * Kersel, M. M., and C. Luke. 2012. A Crack in the Diplomatic Armor: The United States and the Palestinian Authority's Bid for Unesco Recognition. *Journal of Field Archaeology* 37:143-144
- * Meskell, L. 2020. Imperialism, Internationalism, and Archaeology in the Un/Making of the Middle East, *American Anthropologist*, 122/3: 554-567.

WEEK 8 Mali (Oct 20)

- * Ba, O, 2020. Contested Meanings: Timbuktu and the prosecution of destruction of cultural heritage as war crimes, *African Studies Review*, 63/ 4: 743-762
- * Joy, C. 2011. Negotiating Material Identities: Young Men and Modernity in Djenné. *Journal of Material Culture* 16:389-400.
- * Joy, C, 2012. *The Politics of Heritage Management in Mali: From Unesco to Djenné*. Left Coast Press, Inc.: Chapter 5.
- * Joy, C. 2015. "'Unesco Is What?' World Heritage, Militant Islam and the Search for a Common Humanity in Mali," in *World Heritage on the Ground: Ethnographic Perspectives*. Edited by C. Brumann and D. Berliner. Berghan: Oxford.
- * Petrovic, J. 2013. What Next for Endangered Cultural Treasures; the Timbuktu Crisis and the Responsibility to Protect. *New Zealand Journal of Public & International Law* 11:381
- * Meskell, L. 2018. *A Future in Ruins: UNESCO, World Heritage and the Dream of Peace*. OUP, New York. Chapter 8.

WEEK 9 Syria (Oct 27)

- * Meskell, L. 2018. *A Future in Ruins: UNESCO, World Heritage and the Dream of Peace*. OUP, New York. Chapter 7.
- * De Cesari, C. 2015. Colonial Ruins: Why the Islamic State targets Archaeology *Anthropology Today*. Vol. 31 No 6, December
- * Jones, C. 2018. "Understanding ISIS's Destruction of Antiquities as a Rejection of Nationalism." *Journal of Eastern Mediterranean Archaeology and Heritage Studies* 6 (1): 31-58.
- * Plets, G. 2017. "Violins and Trowels for Palmyra: Post-Conflict Heritage Politics." *Anthropology Today* 33 (4): 18-22.
- * Munawar, N. A. 2019. "Cultural Heritage and the Arab Spring: A Review of (Inter) National Efforts to Safeguard Heritage under Fire." in *The World Community and the Arab Spring*, edited by C. Çakmak and A. Özçelik, 83-115. Cham: Palgrave Macmillan.
- * Luke, C. & L. Meskell, 2019. Archaeology, assistance, and aggression along the Euphrates: reflections from Raqqa, *International Journal of Cultural Policy*, 25:7, 831-842,

* Bonn Declaration of World Heritage Webpage

<http://www.39whcbonn2015.de/highlights-and-results/bonn-declaration.html>

*39th World Heritage Committee –Bonn Declaration 06/29/2015

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=-pMwc22Rsz8>

* 'Cultural cleansing is human tragedy of Middle East' – UNESCO chief to RT

<https://www.rt.com/news/317632-unesco-isis-cultural-cleansing/>

WEEK 10 Iraq (Nov 3)

- * Isakhan, B., and L. Meskell. 2019. "UNESCO's project to 'Revive the Spirit of Mosul': Iraqi and Syrian opinion on heritage reconstruction after the Islamic State." *International Journal of Heritage Studies*: 1-16.
- * Bokova, I. 2015. Cultural Heritage: Extremism's New Target. Address by Irina Bokova, Director-General of UNESCO at the Royal Institute of International Affairs. London, 1 July 2015. UNESCO DG/2015/129.
- * Bokova, I. 2015. Fighting Cultural Cleansing: Harnessing the Law to Preserve Cultural Heritage, *Harvard International Review*, 36/4: 40-45.
- * Harmansah O. 2015 "ISIS, Heritage, and the Spectacles of Destruction in the Global Media". 2015. *Near Eastern Archaeology*. 78 (3): 170-177.
- * Isakhan, B. & González Zarandona, J.A., 2018. Layers of religious and political iconoclasm under the Islamic state: Symbolic sectarianism and pre-monotheistic iconoclasm. *International Journal of Heritage Studies*, (1), 1-16.
- * <https://english.alaraby.co.uk/english/indepth/2021/1/21/mosul-a-wounded-city-trying-to-heal>

WEEK 11 Yemen & the Gulf (Nov 10)

- * Bsheer, R. 2017. "Heritage as war." *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 49.4: 729-734.
- * Meskell, L. & B. Isakhan. 2020. UNESCO, World Heritage and the Gridlock over Yemen *Third World Quarterly* 2020:1-16
- * Khalidi, L. 2019. "The destruction of Yemen and its cultural heritage." *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 49.4 (2017): 735-738.
- * Khalidi, L. 2019. "Yemen proves it: in Western eyes, not all 'Notre Dames' are created equal." *The Guardian* 26
- * Peutz, N. 2017. Heritage in (the) Ruins. *International Journal of Middle East Studies*, 49(4), 721-728.
- * Rico, T, and R. Lababidi. 2017. "Extremism in Contemporary Cultural Heritage Debates about the Muslim World." *Future Anterior: Journal of Historic Preservation, History, Theory, and Criticism* 14.1: 95-105.
- * Rico, T. 2019. "Islam, Heritage, and Preservation: An Untidy Tradition." *Material Religion* 15.2: 148-163.
- * Steinbeiser, S. 2018. "Can the "Old Yemen" Survive the "New Yemen"?: The Depredations of War and Other Threats to Yemen's Cultural Heritage." *Yemen and the Search for Stability: Power, Politics and Society After the Arab Spring* (2018): 278.

WEEK 12 India (Nov 17)

- Meskell, L. (2020): Toilets first, temples second: adopting heritage in neoliberal India, *International Journal of Heritage Studies* 1-19.
- Ahmed, H. 2015. *Muslim Political Discourse in Postcolonial India: Monuments, Memory, Contestation*. New York: Routledge.
- Menon, A. G. K. 2015. "Between the Colonial, the Global, and the Local: Civilizing India's past under Different Regimes." In *Cultural Heritage as Civilizing Mission: From Decay to Recovery*, edited by M. Falser, 67–82. Cham: Springer.

- Waraich, S. 2018. “‘Authenticity’ as Intermediary: Contested Memories of the Mughal Fort of Old Delhi.” *International Journal of Islamic Architecture* 7 (1): 107–140.
- Ahmed, H. 2013. “Secularising the ‘Secular’: Monumentalisation of the Taj Mahal in Postcolonial India.” *Economic and Political Weekly* 48 (50): 71–78.
- Menon, J., and S. Varma. 2019. “Archaeological Places: Negotiations between Local Communities, Archaeologists and the State in India.” *Journal of Social Archaeology* 19 (2): 141–161.
- Svensson, T. 2021 “Curating the Partition: dissonant heritage and Indian nation building, *International Journal of Heritage Studies*, 27:2, 216-232.
- Taneja, A.V. 2017. *Jinnealogy: Time, Islam, and Ecological Thought in the Medieval Ruins of Delhi*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.

WEEK 13 (Dec 1)

USA, UNESCO & Black Civil Rights

Discussion with Brent Leggs, Randall Mason (Weitzman School of Design) in working with and nominating American civil rights sites to the World Heritage List.